

Development of a fuzzy multi-criteria model to prioritize strategies to increase tax revenues through tax policies affecting employment

Mohammad Fahkrabadi¹, Hasan Khademi zare^{2*}, Afarin Akhavan³

¹Department of Industrial Engineering, Yazd Branch, University of Science and Arts, Yazd, Iran.

^{2*}Associate Professor, Department of Industrial Engineering, Yazd University, Yazd, Iran.

Corresponding Author Email: hkhademiz@yazd.ac.ir

³Assistant Professor, Department of Industrial Engineering, Yazd Branch, University of Science and Arts, Yazd, Iran

Abstract: Tax is considered an undeniable reality in human societies. This fact exists in rich countries with natural resources as well as the ones lacking such wealth. Today, one cannot study an economy in the world that does not recognize tax as a contributing factor. In Iran, according to the fourth development plan, credit costs should be supplied from non-oil sources, and according to statistics, achieving this goal seems difficult. Presence of effective tax policy is one of the important factors in achieving tax goals. However, formulation of these policies is a multidimensional and difficult task and requires benefitting from collective wisdom of main beneficiaries of tax in various sectors of economic activities. The purpose of this study is to develop policies to increase tax revenues of the government, their evaluation, and the quality of effects of policies on employment. For this purpose, we tried to identify the policies and study their effects in form of Delphi process and multiple targets using tax-economy experts' views. Moreover, because of differences in perceptions of the words low, medium and high, we studied the responses of the experts as fuzzy numbers. Delphi process was conducted in the study with multiple goals, ended after three stages, experts reached a consensus over their views, and identified appropriate policies to increase tax revenues and improve employment. Experts examined each of the proposed policies separately, and their opinions about the intensity of effectiveness were evaluated using Delphi method, so that the experts reached consensus at the end. Using Fuzzy Analytic Hierarchy Process (AHP) and Fuzzy Delphi, we ranked effective tax policies. The results of this study have explained priority of tax policies to achieve the purpose of employment.

Keywords: tax policies, tax revenues, employment, Fuzzy Delphi, multi-criteria

INTRODUCTION

With an emphasis on rapid and continuous economic growth, 20-Year Perspective Document of the government has set achieving first economic place in the Southwest Asian region as one of the goals of the Islamic Republic of Iran. Given the structure of economy of Iran and its current position in the region, and predicting high economic growth for some countries in the region, it is necessary that Iran economy structure move towards a healthy and entrepreneur economy with average GDP growth of over 8 percent in the next two decades to achieve the first economic position. We need to use the existing capacities fully and create new capacities to achieve high economic growth, performing which and creating favorable areas to facilitate and enhance economic and social activities, public welfare, and so on depend on the policies of the governments. Here, one key element of the economic system of the country is its tax system. Tax system has not developed

for various reasons, including abundant oil revenues in different periods according to the country's economic potential, which based on purchasing power parity is the seventeenth most powerful economy in the world in terms of GDP. Despite the blessing of oil and oil revenues, fluctuations in oil prices on world markets have posed great damages to the country's economy. Accordingly, and with sufficient knowledge of the damage that has threatened economy and even national security, policy makers of the country have always stressed the need to reduce the share of oil in the state budget in various programs. Concrete examples of these efforts can clearly be seen in various economic and social development programs of the country. Therefore, attention to strategies and policies to increase tax revenues should be of great importance.

Now, unfortunately, approaches of tax revenues is such that taxpayers escape paying it one way or another and look for some ways to pay lower taxes. This is because it is acted classically to gain tax revenues. Increase in the share of taxes in the state budget is one of the country's development plans. Presence of effective tax policies is one of the important factors in achieving tax goals, but developing tax policies is a multidimensional and difficult task that requires using collective wisdom and main financial interests in various sectors of the economy. Tax experts have different interpretations of the concept of tax policy and its impact on employment according to their thought. Accordingly, we use Fuzzy Delphi, fuzzy multi-criteria decision making, and fuzzy theory for modeling and prioritization of tax policy in conditions of uncertainty in this article. The aim of this study is to design a fuzzy multi-criteria model to prioritize strategies to increase tax revenues in Yazd. The information needed for the model will be gathered from the Directorate General for Economic Affairs and Finance of Yazd. Taxation Affairs Organization believes that, it can play an important role in achieving the goals of achieving a healthy and sustainable economy in the country with the implementation of favorable tax laws and tax administration (Ministry of Economic Affairs and Finance, 2005). In this paper, we try to determine and prioritize the country's tax policy through collective wisdom, so Delphi method is used. However, due to the existence of features such as macro dimensions of the problem, lack of access to accurate information, and subjective and individual opinions of each main beneficiary of tax, fuzzy theory should also be integrated in it.

2. Challenges of state tax system regarding its pillars

2.1. Capacities and existing barriers in national product and income distribution

Combined GDP is an important factor in influencing economic policy objectives and income taxes. Studies show that during development plans, service sector accounts for the highest share in the country's economy. For example, service sector, on average, during the Fourth Development Plan (2005-2010) has accounted for 48.8 percent and the share of oil, agriculture, industries, and mines sectors has been, respectively, 24, 9.4 and 17.8 percent.

By studying GDP composition and calculating value added of tax different bases during the Fourth Development Plan, we can see that despite the fact that value added of jobs in 2010 has been an average of 28.7 percent of GDP, they have paid meager tax. The share of taxes paid by this sector of income tax has been only 8.2 percent. During this course, legal entities (without oil) that have a share equivalent to 23.7% of GDP have accounted for 69% of income tax. Finally, in the mentioned period, agricultural sector has a share as 9.4 percent of GDP, while it has been largely exempted from taxation. Due to the transparency of the financial activities, legal entities bear the highest tax burden in the country's economy. In contrast, lack of transparency of financial circulation of economic actors in business, cash transactions rather than electronic and commitment transactions, lack of access to turnover information of actors in services and jobs sectors, informal activities, or non-registration of many activities increase tax evasion in this sector (Jafari, 2007).

2.2. Functions of tax in country's economic system

In economic literature, three major targets have been considered for taxation. Purpose of taxation is setting tax that governs the financing of state budget through taxes. Economic objectives govern stabilizing economic

fluctuations in stagnation and inflation conditions and allocation of resources between various economic sectors through tax policies, and ultimately social objectives that govern the redistribution of income in society and reduce the gap by means of tax. Three functions of taxation in taxation system of the country have been studied (Abrishami et al., 2012).

Budget functioning of tax

Based on the performance, the dependence of main indicators of the state tax-system budget on oil revenues has imposed lot of problems to the economy of the country. Of these problems, one can mention to imbalance of the operating budget and the increase in liquidity and inflation, so that cover all current expenses of the government during the fourth development plan, of government tax revenues, the ratio of tax to GDP should have been an average of 16.5 percent. In fact, this ratio is a desirable tax ratio that the government should have achieved from tax revenues to cover its operating costs for job creation .

Financial functions of tax (economic management tool)

The second function of tax in economy is financial policy making. Governments sometimes use tax policies, such as reducing tax rates, establishing exemptions and granting other types of incentives to support production, resource allocation or consolidation economic fluctuations to support investment, production, and employment in certain sectors. Because of time-consuming nature of the process of proposing reform in tax laws in Iran, financial functioning of tax is limited. In Iran, one of the reasons of weak role of tax in economic policymaking is limited tax base and therefore not taxable significant portion of GDP. Therefore, the effectiveness of economic policy making through tax depends on the extent of the tax base, the rate of application and enforcement of tax policy done often in many countries through annual government budgets, which is essential to be taken into consideration in Iran as well (Fallahi et al., 2006).

Social functions of tax (redistributing income and wealth in society)

Another function of taxes is the social arena where the government uses tax tool to reduce class gap and increase social equity. Equal treatment to all those who have the same ability to pay (horizontal equity) and different tax treatment with those with different income (vertical equity) are of the most important tax policies in social field and income redistribution. Studying tax laws and regulations of the country shows that it is necessary to observe aspects of tax justice. Obviously, achieving a favorable tax system that besides financing of the state budget and equality and justice can guarantee economic growth and stimulate economy depends on the performance of forming elements of the tax system i.e. national production, tax laws and regulations and tax collection. By strengthening national production, reforming the legal mechanisms, and ultimately, strengthening tax collection agency, one can be hopeful to improve the functioning of the tax system of the country. Besides reviewing the most important obstacles to actualize economic capacity of tax in the country, we will explain requirements and reforms needed to realize tax revenues set (Fallahi et al., 2006).

2.3. Literature review

In a study, Marsden (2009) examined the impact of taxes on economic growth using data from 20 countries. The results show that in low-income countries, taxes have a significant negative correlation with economic growth, while in high-income countries; this relationship is negative but not significant. In a cross-sectional study of 31 countries for the period 1965-2007, Skinner (2011) concluded that there is a negative relationship between ratio of tax revenue to GDP and economic growth rate. Using data from 107 countries over the period 1970-2010, Engine and Skinner (2012) showed that the rate of change in the ratio of tax revenue to GDP is negatively correlated with economic growth. However, the relationship between the ratio of changes of government spending to GDP and economic growth is positive. In an article, Lee et al. (2013) studied the role of skill in determining the optimal rate of income tax and concluded that the optimal tax rate increases with increasing skill as a U shape. In an article entitled "The response of compensation plans to changes in tax

rates,” Gori et al. (2015), concluded that taxation has a significant effect on compensation plans (compensation plans include programs which governments and some companies adopt to offset the reduction in welfare caused by tax increases).

3. Methodology

Methods

This paper is applied in terms of purpose. The aim of research is applied, development of practical knowledge in a particular field. Regarding methodology and the nature, it is correlational. This study aimed to determine the relationships between variables. For this purpose, based on scales of measurement of variables, proper indicators or questions are adopted. The method of the study is deductive-inductive reasoning, data collection to confirm or reject the hypotheses is done in inductive form, and finally, we will use questionnaires, interviews with experts, or field method.

Population

The study population consisted of managers, experts, and policy makers in the field of taxes and the economy of Yazd.

Data collection

We have used library method to formulate hypotheses and to provide literature. In this regard, we have studied scientific articles published in the prestigious domestic and international journals, academic and scientific research and promotional scientific books and theses in the field of accounting related to both international and domestic research. Research data have been collected through interviews with experts and collecting questionnaires for the period from March to December 2015. Unfortunately, controlling Delphi validity and reliability is not easy because due to lack of evidence of reliability, Delphi has been heavily criticized. In other words, if similar information or the questions are given the same panelists, obtaining the same results is not certain. Although users of Delphi have confirmed the accuracy of this technique, this technique has also been criticized in terms of validity. As researcher has no effect on the development process of the survey or the tool, this affects face validity. However, if members participating in the study are the representative of the intended group or knowledge, content validity is guaranteed. However, perhaps, all of the above cases may be the case in qualitative research. Delphi approach should not be judged with quantitative approach, and the use of transferability, credibility, usability, and verifiability criteria for validity and reliability of the results may be more accurate. Considering that questionnaire is designed as Likert scale, the most appropriate method for calculating the reliability is Cronbach's alpha coefficient. Thus, using Cronbach's alpha and collected questionnaires, Cronbach's alpha value was 0.68. Since it is almost equal to 0.7, its reliability is acceptable.

Table 1: Cronbach's alpha coefficient

Reliability Statistics

Cronbach's Alpha	N of Items
.828	28

Reliability Statistics

Cronbach's Alpha	N of Items
.702	3

Data analysis

In the present study, using the document of development plans as well as the policies of Tax Administration, we collect the proposed policies, and using Fuzzy Delphi and the views of economic-tax experts of the province, the effect of each extracted criteria for employment and increase of tax revenues are determined. To determine the final weight of each policy in increase of tax revenues, we have used fuzzy AHP method with employment sub-criteria.

4. Findings

In this section, using Delphi and fuzzy AHP methods, we determine the appropriate tax policies, examine their effects on employment, and ultimately tax revenues with the use of experts' opinions. In general, analysis is used to regulate and summarize data as clear, legible, reasonable, and interpretation information, so that we can discover, evaluate, and test the existing relationships in research issues. We distribute the questionnaire among experts to investigate the hypothesis:

- To what extent do tax policies have an impact on employment?

4.1. Steps of Delphi process**The first stage**

Given the proposed options and linguistic variables defined before, we designed the intended questionnaires. After distributing and collecting the questionnaires, two new proposals have been found. Table 2 presents results of experts' views on each of the policies in the first questionnaire.

Table 2: The results of counting the view of the level questionnaire

Row	Tax policies	Effect on employment		
		Low	Average	High
1	A ₁	4	2	21
2	A ₂	6	7	15
3	A ₃	2	7	10
4	A ₄	1	1	27
5	A ₅	3	15	10
6	A ₆	1	4	24
7	A ₇	2	9	14
8	A ₈	1	4	24

Along with collecting the questionnaires, four proposals were received as follows:

A9: Developing, creating, and using databases of economic activity payers

A10: Strengthening of expertise and oversight of internal auditors

A11: Removing non-economic tax and reducing operating costs

A12: Imposing taxes on total revenues

Based on the results from the questionnaires collected from 30 experts, who have cooperated in the implementation of the study, the average impact on employment criteria is calculated.

Table 3: Average opinions of the first-level questionnaire

Row	Tax policies	Effect on employment
1	A ₁	[5.2,7.8,9.1,9.7]
2	A ₂	[0.8,1.4,2.7,4.6]
3	A ₃	[4.7,5.6,7.1,7.7]
4	A ₄	[5.3,6.4,7.2,8.7]
5	A ₅	[4.1,5.2,6.4,7.7]
6	A ₆	[5.9,7.4,8.7,9.5]
7	A ₇	[4.1,5.6,6.7,8.7]
8	A ₈	[5.2,6.4,7.8,9.4]

Second stage

So far, the initial questionnaire was distributed, the experts' views about each policy and the effectiveness of each were measured, and the overall mean of opinions was calculated. In the next step of Delphi process, we must send the feedback of the opinions for the experts, so send the difference of opinion of each of the experts relative to the average opinions per person. According to the fuzzy nature of numbers, we must calculate the difference from the average for each of the elites. Now, we can develop another questionnaire based on the results, where the difference calculated for each expert has been recorded. In this case, based on a reassessment of each expert compared to his previous opinion, we can achieve new results. The results of this new questionnaire are presented in Table 4.

Table 4: The results of counting the opinions of the second round

Row	Tax policies	Effect on employment		
		Low	Average	High
1	A ₁	0	1	26
2	A ₂	18	1	3
3	A ₃	2	2	25
4	A ₄	1	2	25

5	A₅	3	20	2
6	A₆	0	3	26
7	A₇	7	4	19
8	A₈	0	5	24
9	A₉	3	1	25
10	A₁₀	6	1	22
11	A₁₁	1	4	25
12	A₁₂	4	0	24

Now, we calculate the mean of opinions. The mean of results of experts is presented in Table 5:

Table 5: Mean of vote of experts in the second stage

Row	Tax policies	Effect on employment
1	A₁	[5.8,7.8,9.6,9.9]
2	A₂	[0.7,1.6,3.2,3.7]
3	A₃	[5.3,6.7,7.4,9.2]
4	A₄	[6.1,7.8,8.6,9.5]
5	A₅	[3.7,4.8,5.7,6.5]
6	A₆	[6.4,7.5,8.7,9.6]
7	A₇	[3.8,4.6,5.8,6.5]
8	A₈	[6.2,7.8,8.4,9.6]
9	A₉	[3.6,4.6,5.7,6.3]
10	A₁₀	[9.1,8.3,7.0,6.4]
11	A₁₁	[9.6,8.6,7.1,6.2]
12	A₁₂	[6.7,7.8,8.4,9.5]

Until this stage of study, we distributed questionnaires twice among professionals and collected their opinions. In the meantime, experts completed the second questionnaire with knowledge of the views of the majority. Now, we calculate mean difference to study whether opinions have reached a consensus or not. In other words, to assess whether opinions have reached consensus or not on these opinions on the impact policies, we calculate mean difference. If the mean difference is less than the threshold 0.2, the process stops, so experts have reached a consensus. Results of mean differences are provided in Table 6.

Table 6: Mean difference of opinions of first and second phases

Row	Tax policies	Effect on employment
1	A₁	0.325

2	A ₂	0.07
3	A ₃	0.875
4	A ₄	1.1
5	A ₅	1.5
6	A ₆	0.17
7	A ₇	1.1
8	A ₈	0.8
9	A ₉	-
10	A ₁₀	-
11	A ₁₁	-
12	A ₁₂	-

As can be seen, the mean difference is greater than 0.2, so one can argue that until this step of the fuzzy Delphi process, consensus has not been achieved.

Third level

We will send difference of opinions of expert with mean of opinions to the expert and survey him again. This process should continue until consensus is reached. The results of counting opinions in the third level are in Table 7.

Table 7: The results of the counting opinions in the third level

Row	Tax policies	Effect on employment		
		Low	Low	Low
1	A ₁	0	1	28
	A ₂	15	6	0
2	A ₃	0	0	28
3	A ₄	0	0	29
4	A ₅	2	20	1
5	A ₆	0	3	27
6	A ₇	0	19	5
7	A ₈	0	2	29
8	A ₉	0	0	28
9	A ₁₀	0	3	25
10	A ₁₁	0	0	28

11	A12	0	2	26
----	------------	---	---	----

Until this stage of the investigation, three questionnaires were distributed and experts' opinions were gathered. In Table 7, we present the results of counting the experts' opinions. In Table 8, we present mean of experts' opinions as fuzzy numbers:

Table 8: Average number of opinions in the third level

Row	Tax policies	Effect on employment
1	A₁	[5.6,7.3,9.5,9.9]
2	A₂	[0.6,1.7,3.4,3.9]
3	A₃	[5.5,6.6,7.9,9.2]
4	A₄	[6.5,7.5,8.7,9.4]
5	A₅	[3.6,4.5,5.8,6.5]
6	A₆	[6.2,7.4,8.7,9.8]
7	A₇	[3.6,4.7,5.5,6.4]
8	A₈	[6.4,7.5,8.3,9.5]
9	A₉	[3.7,4.4,5.3,6.9]
10	A₁₀	[6.7,7.5,8.6,9.5]
11	A₁₁	[9.1,8.3,7.6,6.7]
12	A₁₂	[6.4,7.9,8.5,9.7]

Until this stage of fuzzy Delphi process, we distributed questionnaires three times among experts and the results were collected. Along with the distribution of questionnaires in second phase, differences of opinion of experts from the mean of opinions were sent to each expert, so that the person is aware of the majority of opinions and adjust his opinions accordingly. After this stage, we observed that according to the mean difference of opinions between the first and second stages, they did not reach a consensus. Thus, for the third time, we distributed questionnaires among experts and sent the difference of opinions from mean opinions to them. Then the questionnaires were collected and the number of opinions was counted and is visible in the table above. We calculated the mean difference in the second and third levels to assess whether experts have reached a consensus over their views or not, and the results can be seen in Table 9. If the difference is less than 0.2, it can be argued that consensus has been reached and Delphi process is over.

Table 9: Mean difference of opinions of experts in the second and third stages

Row	Tax policies	Effect on employment
1	A₁	0.2
2	A₂	0.1
3	A₃	0.15
4	A₄	0.02

5	A ₅	0.07
6	A ₆	0.02
7	A ₇	0.12
8	A ₈	0.07
9	A ₉	0.02
10	A ₁₀	0.08
11	A ₁₁	0.12
12	A ₁₂	0.02

As can be seen, mean difference in the table is less than 0.2. Thus, Delphi process stops and we can argue that at the end of this stage, consensus has been achieved. So far, we have studied the impact of tax policy on employment. We measured the impact of each component on tax revenues to determine the effect of each policy on increasing tax revenues. Accordingly, at this stage, we weighted the component of employment, and ultimately with the help of AHP, we measured the impact of this policy on tax revenues.

4.2. Determining effective tax policies

Examining the effect of employment on tax revenues increase using fuzzy Delphi method

In this part, the questionnaire was designed and the experts of the previous part were asked to rate the impact of employment criterion on the increase in tax revenues. The study process of this questionnaire is similar to the previous questionnaire, and using fuzzy Delphi method, we examine opinions of experts.

First stage

In the first stage, after distributing the questionnaires and collecting them, results are available in Table 10:

Table 10: Results of counting the opinions in the first stage

Criterion	Experts' opinion		
	Low	Average	High
The effect of employment on increasing tax revenues	5	44	20

The mean of opinions is calculated using fuzzy method and presented in Table 11:

Table 11: Mean of opinions in the first stage

Criterion	Experts' opinion
The effect of employment on increasing tax revenues	[6.4,7.5,8.7,9.8]

Second stage

At this point, the difference of opinion of each expert from those of others is sent to him and he is asked to give his opinion again considering the views of other experts. After collecting questionnaires of the second phase, the results of counting opinions are provided in Table 12.

Table 12: Results of counting opinions in the second phase

Criterion	Experts' opinion		
	Low	Average	High
The effect of employment on increasing tax revenues	2	5	22

Mean of opinions of the second phase are offered in Table 13:

Table 13: Mean of experts' opinions in the second phase

Criterion	Experts' opinion
The effect of employment on increasing tax revenues	[6.3,7.8,8.4,9.6]

At the end of the second phase, we calculate difference between the means of first and second phases and the results are in Table 14:

Table 14: Mean difference of experts' opinion in the first and second stages

Criterion	Mean difference of experts' opinion
The effect of employment on increasing tax revenues	0.07

As mean difference of experts' opinion in the first and second stages is less than 0.2, at the end of the second phase, Delphi process ends. This study showed that employment has a significant impact on tax revenues. We obtained the mean of final opinions using tables 8 and 13 obtained and presented in Table 15.

Table 15: Mean of final opinions

Row	Tax policies	Effect on employment
1	A ₁	[35.3,56.9,79.8,95]
2	A ₂	[3.8,13.3,28.6,37.4]
3	A ₃	[34.7,51.5,66.4,88.3]
4	A ₄	[40.9,58.5,73,90.2]
5	A ₅	[22.7,35.1,72.2,48]
6	A ₆	[39,57.7,73.1,94.1]
7	A ₇	[22.7,36.7,46.2,61.4]
8	A ₈	[40.3,58.5,69.7,91.2]
9	A ₉	[23.3,34.3,44.5,66.2]
10	A ₁₀	[42.2,58.5,72.2,91.2]
11	A ₁₁	[57.3,64.7,63.8,64.3]

12	A12	[40.3,61.6,71.4,93.1]
----	------------	-----------------------

Then, using the data in Table 15, we collected fuzzy numbers for each of the policies, and then defuzzified the set of fuzzy numbers obtained in Table 16, and finally, ranked the number of tax policies and provided them in Table 16.

Table 16: Ranking tax policies

Row	Tax policies	Set of fuzzy numbers	Defuzzification of numbers	Ranking tax policies
1	A₁	[72.1,123.7,174.5,220.5]	148.2	1
2	A₂	[8.5,25.2,52.1,90.5]	42.3	12
3	A₃	[61.9,98,149.7,206]	127.2	8
4	A₄	[75.3,115.5,157.7,212.9]	139.1	6
5	A₅	[50.5,79.5,143.5,140.5]	106.2	9
6	A₆	[80,123.7,162.7,221.6]	145.7	2
7	A₇	[51,82.2,115.6,159.8]	101.1	10
8	A₈	[82.9,124.5,161.3,217]	145.3	3
9	A₉	[43.7,73,100.7,161.3]	92.1	11
10	A₁₀	[101.6,128.2,151.9,171.1]	138.8	7
11	A₁₁	[98.1,126.3,155.7,190.2]	142.1	4
12	A₁₂	[77,117.5,156.4,217.6]	140.4	5

Discussion and conclusion

Given that tax has been raised as an undeniable reality in human societies, and that from the perspective of economists, tax revenues have more stability than other revenues one can consider the importance of developing this for tax revenue of the government high. Moreover, the other aim of this study is to determine the efficiency of these policies in employment. According to experts, the impact of this policy on employment and increase of tax revenues is in the high range, so we can argue that the implementation of introduction of new taxes and expanding tax revenues can affect the economy. With tax revenues, governments can create job opportunities, or in the negative side, by setting tax on low-income jobs can cause loss of them.

Increase of ratio of tax revenues to GDP

According to experts, this policy could not have a major impact on employment and increase of tax revenues, and their opinions reflect the low impact of this policy on the economy. Therefore, only the ratio of tax revenues to GDP could not pave the way for the economy. For more explanation, we can state that the increase in ratio of tax revenues to GDP can be due to decline in production that is not so desirable for economists. In addition, this policy is appropriate when GDP increases and employment increases along with it.

Reducing the financial burden of production sector and investment towards taxes on consumption

According to experts, this policy could have a major impact on the economy, and the consensus of experts is on high impact of this policy on employment and increase of tax revenues. Therefore, this policy could be of important policies to increase tax revenues. Production and investment are the engines of economic generator, and the imposition of tax burden on these sectors could make economy face production and investment recession. Thus, the best solution to increase tax revenues is shifting the tax burden from these sections to consumption section.

Revising or improving tax laws

According to experts, revision of tax laws has huge impact on employment and tax revenues. This result could be arising from the weakness of tax of which experts are well aware. Thus, this policy is among the policy affecting economy. The current tax laws are flawed in the eyes of experts.

Preventing the enactment of new tax exemptions to increase tax revenues and reduce complexity, tax evasion, and tricks

According to experts, this policy and preventing the enactment of new tax exemptions cannot have a significant impact on employment and increase of tax revenues, so it can be discarded from among the politics that affect the economy. In recent years, tax exemption has reduced, but it is observed that this decline has not had a great impact on the economy. Moreover, most tax breaks are related to cultural and religious requirements. According to experts, setting tax to these sectors cannot have much impact on economy and perhaps its negative side effects are much more.

Bridging the gap between actual and potential revenue of tax

According to experts, the gap between actual and potential revenue of tax is high, and reducing this gap can have a large impact on employment and increase of tax revenues. In developed countries, although most do not have the natural resources, there are various forms of taxes, but in our country as the government relies on oil revenues, attention to tax and its bases is less, and so tax bases have great ability to extent.

Promoting self-report method for obedience of payers in paying tax and reducing the cost of tax collection

According to experts, promoting self-report and obedience of payers in paying tax can have a major impact on employment and increasing tax revenues, and can reduce the cost of tax collection. Unfortunately, due to the high dependence of the government on oil revenues and financing the current fund by these revenues, people's culture about paying taxes is affected and taxpayers are not used to pay the tax and obey this method to finance the government. Thus, experts have consensus in this promotion policy, and all have voted to high impact of these policies on the economy.

Developing, creating, and using databases of economic activities of payers

According to experts, this policy does not have much effect on employment and increase of tax revenues and have assessed the effectiveness of this policy average. However, the existence of information bases for economic activities of payers is important theoretically, and can help determine the amount of tax. However, the experts' opinion and their consensus of views on the effects of this policy on the economy is average. It is noteworthy that systems and databases of payers have greatly developed in recent years. Probably, according to the experts, present systems are at an appropriate level and not in priorities for change.

Imposing tax on total revenues

According to experts, setting tax on all revenues has a significant impact on employment and increase of tax revenues. In other countries, income tax is one of the important tax bases for the government, and in Iran over years; only employees have paid their income tax. However, in recent years, obedience of other classes of

to pay taxes has increased. According to experts, all walks of life earning income must pay taxes, and the policies of tax on all revenues could be among the policies affecting the economy.

Analysis method of the study is using experts' opinions are aggregating them. Thus, its result will be criticized less by critiques. According to experts, employment has a significant impact on increasing tax revenues. Theoretically speaking, as employment is more, government can get taxes from more people and its tax revenues increase.

Practical suggestions

According to the hypothesis and proposed policies, we offer the following suggestions:

- Government can increase its tax revenues through the implementation of new taxes, and this affects the country's employment status.
- Shifting the tax burden from production and investment to consumption will help the government in increasing tax revenues and employment through increasing investment and production in the country.
- Tax laws of the country are flawed, so it is recommended that country's tax laws are reviewed and reformed, so that tax evasion and tax exemptions are reduced and tax base increases.
- The gap between tax revenue that the government receives and the amount it should receive it too much, so it recommended that the government eliminate this gap by reforming and expanding the tax base.
- Developing the culture of paying tax and self-report in the community to reduce tax collection costs and increase tax revenues.
- Setting tax on all incomes of people in order to increase tax revenues and eliminate tax breaks

References

- Abrishami, H., Mehrara, M. Applied econometrics (new approaches), Tehran: University Institute of Publishing and Printing, First Edition, Spring 2002
- Aspen Gorry, (2015), "The response of deferred executive compensation to changes in tax rates", Journal of Public Economics, No of Pages 13
- Direct Taxation Act, the Ministry of Economy and Finance (2005).
- Engen, E and J. skinner⁹(2012). Fiscal policy and economic growth, paper presented at NBER conference on taxation Cambridge.
- Falahati, A. et al. (2010) "Estimation of tax using neural networks" Tax Journal, Vol. XVIII, No. 8, Spring and Summer 2010
- Fallahi, M.A., Khaloozadeh, H., Hamidi Alamdari, S. "nonlinear modeling and forecasting tax revenues jobs in the economy", Journal of Economic Research, Issue 63.2006
- Jafari, N. "using Fuzzy Delphi method to determine tax policy", Tarbiat Modarres University, 2007
- Lee,young & Gordon, H, Roger.(2013).Tax structure and Economic Growth, Journal of public Economics, Vol 89, pp 1027-1043.
- Marsden, T. (2009). Rural futures: the consumption countryside and its reregulation European society for rural sociology, (39)4.

Skinner, J. (2011). Taxation and output Growth, Evidence from African countries, NBER working paper, No 2335.