

Science Arena Publications

International Journal of Philosophy and Social-Psychological Sciences

Available online at www.sciarena.com 2017, Vol, 3 (6): 8-17

Studying the effectiveness of psychological empowerment based on Shafiabadi's Multiaxial pattern on teachers' organizational commitment

Zhila Nokani^{1,*}, Abdullah Shafiabadi²

¹Department of Counseling, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran. ²Department of Counseling, allameh tabatabaei university, Tehran, Iran.

Abstract: The objective of this study is to study the effectiveness of psychological empowerment relying Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern on organizational commitment of high school teachers in district 3 of Tehran. The study population consisted of 100 high school teachers in the third district of Tehran city that 40 people were selected as the sample size and simple random sampling in order to substitute the considered persons into the research was used. In order to collect data. Two questionnaires of psychological empowerment and standard organizational commitment were used. Descriptive statistical methods including mean, percentage, frequency and inferential statistics such as posttest covariance analysis removing the effect of pretest, Scheffe test, independent t-test and one-way analysis of variance were used. The results of the analysis showed that education program of psychological empowerment based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern had been effective on total score of organizational commitment. The findings from related statistical test indicated that psychological empowerment based on Shafiabadiis multiaxial pattern has significant difference on the components of emotional and continued commitments. But, it did not have any significant difference and effect on the component of normative commitment. The results of one-way analysis of variance showed that there is not a significant relationship between psychological empowerment of teachers by education level and work experience factors. Also, the results of one-way analysis of variance and Scheffe's test represented that there is a significant relationship between age groups (31 to 40 years) with those of (41 to 50 years) in terms of the effectiveness of psychological empowerment.

Key words: Psychological empowerment, shahfieabadi's multiaxial pattern, education program of psychological empowerment, organizational commitment

INTRODUCTION

Improving current education system and human resources, identifying weaknesses and barriers and providing appropriate implementation and solutions had long been a challenging issue for experts in the field of counseling and the education system (Abdullahi, 2006). In recent years, empowerment as a human resources strategy is used for creating efficacy, efficiency and more organizational commitment of the employees in the workplace (Slazar, 2007). Empowerment of employees is one of the most effective techniques to increase their productivity and optimal use of their individual and group capacity and capabilities parallel to the organizational goals and commitment. Empowerment is a process in which through the development and expansion and the person's ability and influence assists continuous improvement and reform of people's job performance. In other words, empowerment is an organizational development and prosperity strategy. Employees' empowerment means measures and management and counseling strategies such as authority delegation and decision making power to the lower ranks of organization and contributing the employees in information and their access to organizational resources. On the other hand, organizational commitment is an influential factor in organizational behavior of the employees and their organizations efficiency. No organization can succeed unless its members and staff

have had commitment and relative effort. The term of organizational commitment is defined as positive or negative attitudes of the people toward the whole organization working in it. In organizational commitment, people have the strong sense of loyalty to the organization and through which their organization is recognized (Azizi, Mehrabi & Piri, 2009). It can be stated that human resources loyalty and committed are of the Excellency of an organization than others. Understanding the organizational commitment of the employees can assist managers in improving their prosperity. Thirty years ago, there has been spent considerable interests for the understanding of organizational commitment and much more resources have been taken into account for analyzing this issue. Recently, organizational commitment has been extensively studied in the literature of organizational behavior as a variable. This fact results from its impact on people's loyalty to the organization, accepting the goals of organization by employees, the survival of employees in the organization, its relationship with the motivation, job satisfaction and leaving the job. Also, since one of the hidden factors that influence employees' job behavior is their commitment to the organization, taking organizational commitment into consideration either in public sector or the private sector is very important. Understanding the organizational commitment of the employees can assist managers in improving their staff. Many pieces of evidence show that organizational commitment is one of the most important determinants and powerful predictors of organizational behavior. Department of Education requires having hardworking, enthusiastic and committed teachers in order to fulfill its superior goal which is educating humans. Committed teachers having practical and sense of responsibility do their duties the best and cause to increase the efficiency, effectiveness and productivity of educational system. Teachers as human resources are the most important factors in education organization. These factors move the wheels of the organization to be continued the organization's survival; preventing its deterioration, being useful in the community and the life certificate of the organization shows originality, creativity, development and progress. Education is one of the governmental agencies. Such an organization requires committed and responsible teachers and staff for the implementation of developmental programs and progress. Department of Education can have new things to say when its human resources exhibit themselves professional, work values, commitment and participation to the organization and have more working contribution. However, one of the main problems of organizations in today's changing highly revolutionized world is the identification of the factors affecting the emergence of organizational commitment as well as the empowerment in the context of emerging phenomena in organizational behavior. According to the issues presented in the context of empowerment and organizational commitment, Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern and its impact on these two variables can be investigated. Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern is a native one which has progressing attitude to job choosing. Based on this pattern, guidance and counseling theories generally and guidance and career counseling theories particularly are affected by public opinion and cultural foundations of society. Career choosing based on this pattern is the dynamic and purposeful action which takes place regarding self-concept, the satisfaction of needs and decision-making strength within the lifestyle. Dimensions and implications of this pattern involve self-concept, needs and decision making (it is worth mentioning that the above three mentioned components will be considered due to more adaptability and application with current research and also in the education and so two other components are avoided). This pattern is comprehensive and puts together several of the basic concepts and therefore are expected to be applicable to different classes. On the other hand, this model is thrifty in its description, and no matter how complex and long term are used, explains the factors influencing the growth path of occupation choosing. On the other hand, this pattern, as compound and multiaxial one, seems to culminate in to the applications and useful researches in various occupational areas. Hence, it can be concluded that Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern is the one that has collected main basics of the majority of growth path in occupation choosing and can have greater useful application. In this study, we decided to investigate the effectiveness of empowering with regard to Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern with organizational commitment. Finally, with regard to cited discussions and researcher's intellectual curiosity that how and which position the role of Shafiabadi's pattern has in the effectiveness of empowerment and organizational commitment of teachers; The main research question is followed: can

the empowerment according to the Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern be influential on organizational commitment of female and male teachers in the third district of Tehran city? It is hoped, respecting the importance of issue and researcher's extensive research, the results of this study will give broader vision in the field of empowerment and organizational commitment as well as Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern in the Education. Additionally, it is hoped its results to be useful, applicable and implementable among teachers across the country.

Research hypotheses

- 1- Psychological empowerment based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern is effective on the whole score of the high school teachers' "organizational commitment" in third district education of Tehran.
- 2- Psychological empowerment based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern is effective on the commitment components "organizational commitment" of Tehran.
- 3- There is a significant relationship between the indices of gender, age, education level and work experience with psychological empowerment of the teachers based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern.

Research methodology

The methodology used in this study is a quasi-experimental of pretest – posttest type without control group. The population in this study consists of 100 high school teachers in the district 3 of Tehran working in the academic year of 2014-15. The questionnaire was conducted and distributed between 100 teachers and among them, 58 participants who received the lowest scores in the empowerment questionnaire were chosen. Then, organizational commitment questionnaire was given to these people and 40 persons who received low scores in job satisfaction were selected. The sample size for this study was 40 persons according to the above process. Simple random sampling was used to replace the subjects in the experimental group.

The tools used to collect data are followed as:

- 1- Psychological empowerment questionnaire: in the study, psychological empowerment questionnaire of Arjomand (2013) which has been designed and prepared based on the education program of Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern in 31 items as well as to measure psychological empowerment relying the mentioned pattern was used. It is worthy to note that the questionnaire was made as researcher-based. In order to ensure its reliability, first the questionnaire of 30 persons of the population was experimented and implemented.
- 2- A standard questionnaire designed by Alan Meyer (2004) will be used to measure teachers' organizational commitment. The mentioned tool measures three dimensions of organizational commitment on 24 items including emotional commitment (1-8 with questions), continuous commitment (with questions 9-16) and normative commitment (with questions 17-24). The questionnaire based on Likert scale (from 1 strongly disagree to 5 strongly agree) was scored. The reliability of the questionnaire has been also determined by the internal consistency method and using Cronbach's alpha coefficient of 0.89.

Methods of research

- 1- preparation of educational programs: in order to prepare the educational program of psychological empowerment based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern, available resources and related books as well as the supervision of supervisor, the relevant skills on educational program were scheduled for an academic course for 6 sessions. Each session of 90 minutes was done with a frequency of one session per week.
- 2- study implementation: the current research was carried out in form of empowerment of human resources (teachers) of the education. The mentioned education program lasted from October 10 to the first day of December of 2013. During this period, 6 education sessions and three evaluation were conducted:

A) during the pretest before the beginning of formal education curriculum. B) doing posttest immediately after the end of the course. C) conducting follow-up test 20 days after the last education session.

The steps of this project are included: 1. Implementation of empowerment population among all population group and choose those who received a low score in psychological empowerment. 2. Pretest implementation and choosing the ones who received the lowest score in the organizational commitment test. 3. Random assignment of subjects in the experimental group. 4. Implementing the independent variable in the experimental group. 5. Posttest implementation.

Table 1. Summary of education program of psychological empowerment based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern at a glance

Session	content						
1	Familiarization, determining goals and expectations of the workshop, pre-test						
	implementation						
2	Familiarization of the participants with the concepts of Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern						
	and the basics of psychological empowerment						
3	The issue of staff empowerment, identification of disturbing cases of the empowerment,						
	education of multiaxial pattern components						
4	Concepts explanation: purposefulness, dynamic, decision-making, needs, and self-						
	concept, examples offering and the titles in this regard.						
5	Identification of existing obstacles in the field of application of each of the multiaxial						
	pattern components, implementation of group discussion concerning in the role of each						
	component of psychological empowerment.						
6	Summing up the material presented, evaluation of assignments, posttest run,						
	appreciation of the participants during the training sessions, say goodbye.						

Research findings

In this study, descriptive and inferential statistics were used to analyze the data. In analyzing the data in terms of descriptive statistics from frequency tables, percentages and mean related to sociological information were applied. And, inferential statistics in statistical analysis including: posttest covariance analysis after removing pretest effect, Scheffe test, independent t-test and one-way analysis of variance were used.

The main hypothesis of the research: education of psychological empowerment based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern is effective on the total score of organizational commitment of the teachers.

Table 2. Results of t-test to determine the effect of pre-test and post-test scores

	Number	Mean	Standard	T	Df	Significance
			deviation			level
Pretest	40	133.201	11.452	41.47	39	0.00
Posttest	40	209.654	7.94			

According to the results of the T test and the data presented in Table 2 showing (t= 41.47) with degree of freedom (df= 39), and significance level (0.000), it could be stated that psychological empowerment education based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern had significant effect on pretest and posttest. As a result, it can be said that psychological empowerment education by Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern has effect on the total score of organizational commitment.

First hypothesis: psychological empowerment based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern is effective on the total score of "organizational commitment" of high school teachers in the education in the third district of Tehran.

Table 3. T-test results to evaluate the effects of psychological empowerment based Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern on the organizational commitment components

Components		Mean	Standard deviation	Т	Df	Significance level
Emotional commitment	Pretest	39.11	3.67	37.58	39	0.000
	Posttest	86.19	5.66			
Continuous commitment	Pretest	21.37	3.12	25.83	39	0.000
	Posttest	44.89	2.06			
Normative commitment	Pretest	28.40	3.33	3.24	39	0.763
	Posttest	25.32	3.57			

According to the results of data analysis and T test results in table (3), it can be concluded that empowerment test based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern has had a significant effect on emotional and continuous commitment components. Consequently, empowerment education using multiaxial pattern had been influential on the teachers and mentioned components. On the contrary, results showed that education has not a significant difference on normative component as one of the dimensions of organizational commitment, thus empowerment education based on multi-axial pattern is not effective on these components.

The second hypothesis: there has been a significant difference between the parameters of gender, age, education level and work experience with psychological empowerment of the teachers based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern.

Table 4. One-way analysis of variance to assess the psychological empowerment of teachers in terms of work experience in the studied population.

Variation source	Sum of squares	Degree of freedom	Mean square	F	Significance
Between- group variance	820.538	3	164.117	1.375	0.292
group variance					
Inter-group variance	1670.617	36	119.330		
Total	2491.200	39			

As the data in Table 4 shows, as the calculated F is (F = 1.375) with degree of freedom (df = 14.5), hence we can conclude that there is no significant difference between the means of studied population based on work experience.

Table 5. One-way analysis of variance to assess the psychological empowerment of teachers by age in the study population.

Variation	Sum of	Degree of	Mean square	F	Significance
source	squares	freedom			
Between-	1.23	33	0.412	3.64	0.013
group					
variance					
Inter-group	27.76	36	0.113		
variance					
Total	28.99	39			

Continued, Scheffe test was used to clarify the issue of between which age groups in terms of the effectiveness of the psychological empowerment of teachers is significant difference.

Results of Scheffe test indicated that there is a significant difference between age groups (31 to 40 years), age groups (41 to 50 years) in terms of the effectiveness of the psychological empowerment.

Table 8. One-way analysis of variance to assess the psychological empowerment of teachers by education level in the population under study.

Variable	Index	Mean	Standard	Т	Df	Significance
			deviation			level
Gender	Man	136.28	10.25	0.97	39	0.36
	Woman	131.18	12.17			
Degree	Bachelor	130.93	9.76	0.604	39	0.143
	Master	135.13	14.12			

The results of T-independent test and Table 8 show, as the T value computed for each gender and degree are 0.97 and 0.604 respectively; considering the test results, it can be concluded that no significant relationship exists between psychological empowerment of teachers in education level.

Discussion and conclusion

The aim of this study is to study psychological empowerment based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern on organizational commitment of high school teachers of district 3 in Tehran. In the upcoming developments, by counseling career profession and psychology, it can be predicted that the use of educational-mental approaches and solution-focused ones (including Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern) to increase due to efficacy and cost-effectiveness. In this regard, many scholars and theorists including Daricourse (2002) argues that human-beings have not the capacity of their own wisdom and creative force, so they need to know them and apply. In this way, employees can benefit from their psychological processes resulting from internal energy increase and the promotion of psychological empowerment. In this context and as the results of this study, it is suggested that, confirmation of the effectiveness of educational programs determines employees' empowerment promotion on organizational commitment and taking the advantage of such application-oriented approaches causes to enhance the empowerment of the people.

Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern with an endemic looks is derived from native Iranian culture that its assumptions are mainly based on the principles of individual psychology and has provided the fields of growth and development with the aim of promoting psychological empowerment. However, it is based on strong foundations in this field. Likewise, given the importance of the issue and the lack of research in this field, we tried to carry out this study and follow the targeted research in order to investigate the effectiveness of psychological empowerment according to Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern focusing on

organizational commitment. The findings of this study and the results are promising and good-tiding and acknowledges the importance and potential value of psychological empowerment interventions based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern.

The first hypothesis was: "the effectiveness of educational program of psychological empowerment based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern on the total score of organizational commitment of high school teachers in district 3 of Tehran city." The results of the data analysis and the results of Table (4-4) showed that the total score of organizational commitment of the teachers who participated in educational course of psychological empowerment based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern has significantly increased (p< 0.000); in other words, psychological empowerment educations based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern increases total score of organizational commitment of the experimental group.

Such personality features of empowerment people: patience, determination, insistence on values, happiness, sense of humor and being purposeful in life (Salimibejestani, 2009) can be considered. The results indicate that having existential meaning and purposefulness in life are of the most important features of psychological empowerment promotion that these two categories are of the targets of Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern. In the training process of empowerment based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern of current goals, the methods of achieving goals, obstacles in achieving the goals were studied that according to the findings of the research, it can be indicated that one of the reasons of increasing psychological empowerment is the educational components of Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern that was welcomed by participants.

Psychological empowerment in Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern is in alignment with organizational goals. According to the researchers of behavioral sciences, the human being is the one who is able to perform all actions in order to achieve the objectives. In this regard, Maslow also believes that the difficulties and desires can evolve creativity, a sense of adequacy and ambiguity tolerance and a creative and flexible person and the one who faces confidentially and recklessly new events can solely manage the future. Ferguson (2005) believes that having the courage to be imperfect is really psychologically empowerment.

At the stages of empowerment training based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern, the aim is to encourage self-actualization and create the insight than the dedication and commitment of individuals with regard to the principle of empowerment through which believe their innate abilities in the process of their changing behavior and undertake their internal processes in order to commit in their working environment.

In explaining this, and according to the conducted studies and this study; it can be stated that Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern because of generating mainly from individually psychological assumptions and parameters, is based on strong bases in terms of career, commitment promotion and the empowerment of individuals. There is few researches in this field indicating the pristineness and nobleness of the current study. Notwithstanding, existing few studies and literatures also show the effectiveness of this pattern on educational environments.

Second research hypothesis

Respecting the second hypothesis of the study entitled "education program of psychological empowerment based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern is effective on the components of organizational commitment of high school teachers in district 3 of Tehran." According to the obtained results of data analysis and T test table (5-4), it can be concluded that empowerment test based on Shafiabadi approach has been a significant difference on emotional commitment with the score of (T=37.58) and (df=39), significance level (0.000) as well as on the continuous commitment with (T=25.83) and (df=39) and a significance level (0.000). Accordingly, empowerment education based on the multiaxial pattern had been effective on the teachers on the mentioned components. But the results showed that education on normative component as one of the dimensions of organizational commitment has significant difference. Thus, empowerment education based on the multiaxial pattern is effective on this component. Results of Table (4-4) shows (T=3.24) and (df=39) and a significance level (0.763) suggests lack of the effectiveness of

psychological empowerment education program based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern on the normative commitment. In connection with this hypothesis, there are not direct researches covering current study variables, but, in following, they are used to explain and evaluate the hypothesis of this hypothesis from similar researches regarding the efficiency and effectiveness based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern.

This finding is consistent with the result of Sayyadi et al. (2014), which conducted a research to compare the effectiveness of the education based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern and cognitive model of Thomas & Velthous Shafiabadi on psychological empowerment of the consultants. Additionally, the results showed that the training program based on two models has a positive and significant impact on increasing the psychological empowerment of the consultants.

Of other researches carried out on the effectiveness of Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern, we can point out to researches of Fekri, Shafiabadi, Nouranipour and Ahghari (2012) which studied in their study to assess the effectiveness of Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern and compromise of Constraints and Gottfredson theory on entrepreneurial skills of the students. The results showed that career counseling by Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern is effective to increase the entrepreneurial skills of students. These researches are somehow in compliance to the effectiveness of Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern of research variables.

To explain these findings, multiaxial pattern expressing applicable components such as dynamics, needs and also purposefulness on the choice of profession, essentially, mobility, creativity and vitality in career points should be noted. As mentioned, the people having low organizational commitment, very low creativity and decision-making power, do not consider themselves committed to achieving organizational goals. This pattern by introducing its bases and components in this field; educates mobility, flexibility and thus the empowerment of individuals in order to undertake education. Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern with which the individuals are educated based on targeted components as well as by having the goal in the field of achieving their career goals ideology in this field has identified and attempted clearly. Educating this dimension of mentioned pattern is effective on those with low organizational commitment with no idea and opportunity to their commitment.

In addition, this pattern assists with self-concept component of the people with low commitment to understand the factors affecting organizational commitment as well as their self-concept to be navigated from negative self-concept to positive one and had better performance in their career with organizational commitment and promotion.

The other aspect of this pattern is decision-making that helps the person taking the right decisions and risky stages of his/her career behind and thus achieving high organizational commitment.

Third research hypothesis

The third hypothesis was "There is a significant relationship between the indices of gender, age, education level and work experience with psychological empowerment of the teachers based on Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern".

In this regard, the results of one-way analysis of variance showed that as the calculated F (F= 1.375) is with degree of freedom (df= 14.5), so it can be concluded that there is no significant difference between the means of studied population based on work experience. Scheffe analysis results showed there was a significant difference between age groups (31 to 40 years) and age groups (41 to 50 years) in terms of the effectiveness of the psychological empowerment. The findings of T test and Table (8-4) demonstrated, as the value of calculated T for each variable of gender and degree is 0.97 and 0.604, respectively, it can be concluded that no significant relationship exists between psychological empowerment of teachers in education level.

Reference

Allen, JN. Meyer JP. (2010). "Affective continuance and normative commitment to the oranization an examination of construct validity". Journal of vocational behaviour. Vol. 49 (3). PP: 252-76.

- Arjmand, Maliheh (2013). Psychological empowerment of pharmaceutical women workers in Ahura city of Shiraz province on the basis of Shafiabadi's multiaxial pattern. Master's thesis, University of Allameh Tabatabai.
- Belcourt, M., Bohlander, G., and Snell, S. (2008). "Managing human resources". 5th Canadian edition. Thomson Nelson.
- Casper, W.J. (2006). An Examination of proxy measures of work place spirituality: A profile Model of Multi-dimensional Constructs. Journal of Leadership & Organizational Studies, 12 (4), 109-118.
- Cevat celep (2011) "Teacher's organizational commitment in educational organizations" national foram of teacher education journal volume 10, No3.
- Currivan, D. B. (2008) The causal order of job satisfaction and organizational commitment in models of employee turnover. Human Resource Management Review, 9(4), 495 524.
- Fives, H. R., Hamman, D., & Olivarez, A. (2005). Does burnout begin with student teaching? Analyzing efficacy, burnout, and support during the student teaching semester. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association, Montreal, CA.
- Fullerton, G. (2014). The moderating effect of normative commitment on the service quality-customer retention relationship. European Journal of Marketing, 48(3/4), 657-673.
- Gorton, Richard. Alston, Judya. & Snowdent, Petra (2012). School leadership & Administration important concept. case studies & Simulations, organizational Resources.
- Ibrahim, M., & Iqbal, M. (2015). Teachers' Perceptions of Professional Commitment (Affective, Continuance and Normative Commitment) to Teaching Profession. European Journal of Business and Management, 7(10), 64-80.
- Kinjerski, V., and Skrypnek, B. (2008). The promise of spiritual work Increasing Job Satisfaction and Organizational Commitment and Reducing Turnover and Absenteeism in long term care. Journal of Gerntoplogical Nursing, 34 (10), 17-27.
- Marks. Helen M., Printy. Susan M. (2007). Principal Leadership and School Performance: An Integration of Transformational and Instructional Leadership Educational Administration Quarterly. Vol. 86, No. 8. pp 815-861.
- Meyer, J. P., Stanley, D. J., Jackson, T. A., McInnis, K. J., Maltin, E. R., & Sheppard, L. (2012). Affective, normative, and continuance commitment levels across cultures: A meta-analysis. Journal of Vocational Behavior, 80(2), 225-245.
- Redmon EdD, Robert. J (2007). Impact of teacher preparation upon teacher self-efficacy. Presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Association for Teaching and Curriculum at Cleveland, Ohio, October 0
- Richards Beverly- Terrance O,Brien- Duane Akreyd (2009) "Predicting the organizational commitment of marketing education and heatlh occupations education teachers by work related related re wards" North Carolina state university.
- Sargent. T & Hannum. E (2009). Ob satis faction among primary school Teachers in Rural china university of Pennsylvania.
- Shafiabadi, A. (2012). Career counseling and career guidance theories (with revisions and additions). Tehran, growth press.
- Weiss (2005). The Four "I's" of School Reform: How Interests, Ideology, Information, and Institution Affect Teachers and Principals. Harvard Educational Review, 65(4),571–592.

International Journal of Philosophy and Social-Psychological Sciences, 2017, Vol. 3 (6): 8-17

Zhou, Z., Jin, X. L., Fang, Y., & Vogel, D. (2015). Toward a theory of perceived benefits, affective commitment, and continuance intention in social virtual worlds: cultural values (indulgence and individualism) matter. European Journal of Information Systems, 24